

(As on 31.3.2017)

Summarised Outcome of complete evaluation studies/reviews conducted in respect of the Schemes/Programmes being implemented by the M/o Minority Affairs and under the PM's New 15 Point Programme for Welfare of Minorities

Evaluation studies conducted in r/o schemes of M/o Minority Affairs		
S.N.	Name of the Scheme	Details of the observations made in the study report
1.	Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme	Impact assessment of the scheme has been carried out by an independent agency Research & Development Initiative. From the study, it is observed that the Scheme has been able to achieve its objectives to a large extent as it has reached the most deprived in the minorities; raised their demand for school education; reduced the financial burden of poor parents; enabled most children to stay through school education; and improve their performance levels. The scheme has contributed significantly towards the long term objective of empowering the minorities through education.
2.	Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme	Impact assessment of the scheme has been carried out by an independent agency Research & Development Initiative. From the study, it is observed that the Scheme has been able to achieve its objectives to a large extent as it has reached the most deprived in the minorities; raised their demand for higher secondary and higher education; somewhat reduced the financial burden of poor parents; enabled a large proportion of beneficiaries to stay through their course/higher education; improved their performance levels. These perceived impacts of the Post-matric Scholarship Scheme are statistically significant. The scheme has contributed significantly towards the developmental objective of empowering the minorities through education.
3.	Merit-cum-Means based Scholarship Scheme	Impact assessment of the scheme has been carried out by an independent agency Research & Development Initiative. From the study, it is observed that the Scheme has been able to achieve its objectives to a large extent as it has reached the most deprived in the minorities; raised their demand for technical and professional education; somewhat reduced the financial burden of poor parents; enabled a large proportion of beneficiaries to stay through their technical/professional course; improved their performance levels and more significantly raised their aspirations for further study. These perceived impacts of the Merit-cum-Means based Scholarship Scheme are statistically significant. The scheme has contributed significantly towards the long term objective of empowering the minorities through education.

4.	Free Coaching & Allied Scheme	<p>Major findings of the impact assessment of the scheme has carried out by an independent agency viz. Hi-Tech Institute of Information Technology are as under :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Universities and well-established institutes of learning; education and research including NGOs may be promoted to run their coaching institutions as they have plenty of experienced, qualified and competent faculties and other infrastructure like library, hostels etc. • Accountability is enforced in terms of success rate of the programmes and preference be given to professional institutions having required facilities. • Girls from minorities may be given preference in admission in such coaching institutions. They should be provided social security, separate toilet facility, hostel and individual career guidance. • Performance indicators for monitoring the overall success of the coaching institutions be evolved and the coaching centres which are unable to get the minimum qualifying marks in terms of success rate, the support should be withdrawn by the government. Besides, the coaching institutions should insist on enrolment of students for specific examination only and not for appearing for various examinations as it affects their concentration.
5.	Multi-sectoral Development Programme (MsDP)	<p>An evaluation study on the working of MsDP was conducted by Indian Institute of Public Administration, N. Delhi.</p> <p>1. Observations & Recommendations: Based on the views of all stakeholders, including beneficiary families/ individual respondents, the major findings of the study are as follows.</p> <p>a. MsDP started with individual welfare oriented programme funding housing as a supplement to IAY. While the targets were partially achieved, focus was shifted later to funding of durable institutions delivering lasting public goods. This includes ITIs, polytechnics, degree / inter-colleges, ACRs, hostels (for both boys and girls), health centres, sub centres, PHCs, renovations of existing PHCs/CHCs, providing equipments etc. to hospitals and above all setting up training centres for imparting skills to young boys and girls, facilitating their entry to modern employment sector.</p> <p>b. A very large number of such assets are yet to become operational because MsDP projects are handled by the concerned state governments departments/ agencies functioning at different levels, causing excessive delay. For instance, out of 145 educational institutions</p>

	<p>identified in the study areas across six heavily minority (mainly Muslims) concentrated areas only 17 were functional. Physical construction of buildings or additional rooms has been largely completed, excepting those cases where second installment has not reached because of procedural delay, including non-receipt of UC. In a way, MOMA is doing its assigned job but if outcomes are not visible in majority of cases, the fault lies at the doorsteps of concerned state government departments.</p> <p>c. There is huge concentration of minority population in the north-eastern districts of Bihar (Kishanganj etc.) and contiguous parts in north Bengal (Murshidabad, Uttar Dinajpur, Malda, for instance). These poverty-stricken districts also suffer from lack of employment opportunities. Effectively, half of the adult population is barely literate. Imparting them with skills is the foremost task. But given the magnitude of poverty, underemployment, dropouts, and absence of quality education, multipronged intervention is required. There is urgent need of quality education for the children coming from poor families in minority concentrated areas. These first generation learners would require not only good school buildings but also competent teachers, nutritious food and a congenial atmosphere to internalize what is offered to them. All these seemingly compartmentalized problems can be taken care of by setting up good residential schools.</p> <p>d. The IIPA study has therefore recommended running Boarding Schools in High Minority Concentration Areas in partnership with sister organization like Maulana Azad Educational Foundation and Navodaya Vidyalaya Sanghathna (NVS) as well as Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya (KGBV).</p> <p>e. ITIs/ Polytechnics: Apart from raising few qualitatively improved institutions, MoMA can also consider setting up societies for running health care facilities. The MoMA can also work out a model of public private partnership (PPP) that could be forwarded to the states to follow with suitable modifications, wherever required. Linking these institutions with national skill development council would be equally necessary.</p> <p>f. Skill Centres: Skill Centers are yet to be set up in all eastern states where proportionate concentration of minorities is very high. They are non-existent in states like Bihar, Jharkhand and Assam. In Bengal and Tripura they</p>
--	---

are available. While these centres are performing well in Tripura, a clear mis-match between demand and supply was seen in the districts of Bengal. This anomaly can be corrected by decentralizing responsibility of setting skill centers to the district level.

g. **Multi-level Effective Monitoring:** Reconstituting the committees at all levels – Cluster Level Committee (CLC), Block level (BLC), District level (DLC) and the State level (SLC). The first two from below are more crucial. First of all, invite suggestions for nominations of people into these committees with reasoning for considering those nominations. The Ministry can go for a technologically sound and user friendly mobile Apps. Selecting the required numbers and putting them on Apps for receiving the feedback would be next step. Based on that scrutiny, list of finalist could be formed and put on Apps and in the district webpage as well.

h. Cluster approach, narrowing down further by recognizing Muslim/ minority concentrated cluster as unit of selection and execution of projects, rather than Block as a Unit.

i. Persuading the concerned state governments to design their perspective plan to cover development deficits in the designated MCBs\MCTs would help minimize wastage and duplication of assets.

j. For effective inter-departmental coordination, it is necessary to ensure involvement of new institutional structures created at the district level and below, under NRHM, for instance. Why can't the district programme manager (DPM) and her block level counterpart (BPM) be involved in the projects under MsDP? This could also help institutionalize the block level facilitators (BLF) by making them part of DPM. Their energy and potentials can be harnessed by linking them with bigger functional units working on similar terms and conditions.

k. Finally, MsDP benefits may not have reached everybody/ minority population in the targeted areas, but given the number of public institutions/ infrastructure (ACRs/ ITIs/Hostels/ Drinking Water Supply) & individual assets (IAY) created, it has touched, even indirectly, the lives of the people in the villages and towns covered under this study. Launched under 12th plan, these projects would take time to fructify. Meanwhile, thanks to the efforts of MoMA, issues pertaining to minorities have come to the forefront. Media, civil society and think tanks all have

		started taking note of minorities. The MoMA must be given credit for that. Still it has to go a long way to cover the development deficits in minority concentration areas.
6.	NMDFC loan schemes	NMDFC is a Central Public Sector Enterprise under the administrative control of the Ministry of Minority Affairs. As far as NMDFC is concerned, it regularly engages a 3 rd Party independent consultancy organisation for verification of beneficiaries financed two years ago and also Impact of its schemes on the target Minority groups. The last such study was carried out by Andhra Pradesh Industrial & Technical Consultancy Organisation Ltd; (APITCO) in 2015-16 and its observations is that the socio-economic condition of the beneficiaries has improved after availing assistance under the schemes of NMDFC. As such, the schemes of NMDFC have yielded the desired results of bringing about socio-economic development in the lives of the target minority groups.
7.	Nai Roshni – The Scheme for Leadership Development of Minority Women	NITI Aayog has conducted an evaluation study of this scheme with a view to assess the impact of the scheme on minority women and to identify policy programme impediments in its implementation. Majority of findings of the study indicate the programme has been appreciated by most of the segments of the society and it has assisted in creating confidence among minority women and developing leadership spirit in them. The trained women are utilising their enriched knowledge within their surroundings and thereby helping their families as well as neighbours in raising their essential demands and claims from various Government authorities.
8.	Seekho aur Kamao – The Skill Development Scheme	Evaluation and impact assessment of this scheme has been conducted by National Productivity Council during 2016-17. The outcome of the study that the scheme has been well accepted by the targeted beneficiaries and has been able to generate gainful employment besides improving the economic condition of minority communities. It also meets the skill upgradation requirement of minority youths in modern as well as traditional trades besides empowering them to face the market challenges and avail employment opportunities. NPC has opined that the scheme has achieved its outlined objectives to a considerable extent.
Evaluation studies conducted in respect of Schemes being implemented by other Ministries/Department covered under PN's New 15 PP for Welfare of Minorities.		
9.	<u>M/o Human Resources Development</u> Sarva Siksha Abhiyan (SSA)	The evaluation study on “Assessment of facilities available in Primary and Upper Primary Education in Muslim predominant areas” under SSA has been carried out by Jamia Millia Islamia through Educational Consultants India

10	Scheme for Providing Quality Education in Madarasas (SPQEM)	Ltd. while the evaluation studies on SPQEM and IDMI have been carried out by KR Narayanan Centre for Dalit & Minorities Studies in Jamia Millia Islamia.
11.	Infrastructure Development of Minority Institutions (IDMI)	These studies generally give observations on the present working of the schemes and make recommendations for improvement in their effective implementation. D/o School Education & Literacy, HRD has informed that evaluation study reports, in respect of the above schemes, have been shared with all the implementing States. The inputs/recommendations made by the evaluation study will be taken into consideration at the time of restructuring the schemes.
12.	Mid-day Meal Scheme	The Mid-day meal scheme was extended to all areas in the country from the year 2007-08 onwards and also covers upper primary schools. Blocks with concentration of Muslim population are covered under this scheme. Children in Madarasas are also covered under the programme. Independent evaluation of the Scheme has affirmed a positive educational, nutritional and social impact of the Scheme. Extension of the Scheme has increased enrolment of Muslim children, in elementary education from 1.97 crores in 2008-09 to 2.55 crores in 2011-12 at primary stage and from 0.43 crores to 0.72 crores at upper primary stage. The ratio of Muslim girls to boys at upper primary level has increased from 0.98 in 2008-09 to 1.05 during 2011-12.
13	Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas (KGBVs)	It has been informed that the National Evaluation of KGBVs was undertaken by 24 independent experts in November-December 2013 and covered 24 States. The report highlights main findings, some good practices, the challenges faced, the problems encountered as well as the recommendations. The same have been shared with all the States with the direction to take remedial action. The States have also informed the action taken in this regard. State specific monitoring of the issues raised in the evaluation is also being done. The progress is reviewed at the National level workshops relating to gender and funds have been released to the States on the condition of maintaining safety and security to girls and conducting regular review of the teachers, their training and curriculum.
14.	<u>Department of Rural Development</u> Indira Awas Yojana (IAY) (renamed as Pradhan Mantri Awas	The study has been conducted by the National Institute of Rural Development (NIRD), Hyderabad. The study report observes that the impact of IAY on beneficiaries' life,

15.	<p>Yojana (Gramin)</p> <p>SGSY/Aajeevika/ Revamped as Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana – National Rural Livelihoods Mission (DAY- NRLM)</p>	<p>livelihood and well being was manifold. IAY has ushered in new life style with improved standard of living. This was basically due to availability of safe drinking water, use of sanitary toilets, use of electrical appliances and smokeless chullahs. The beneficiaries had access to health care services and banking facilities after securing the IAY house. This has enhanced social status of the minority beneficiaries and higher accessibility to different services like good schooling and financial literacy, participation in village decision making and greater role in different government schemes and programmes.</p> <p>The M/o Rural Development has informed that as a follow up to the above report, the Govt. has, inter alia, made a policy announcement to achieve the goal of “pucca houses for all” by 2022, when the nation would be celebrating the Platinum Jubilee of its Independence and it is proposed to enhance the assistance for construction and upgradation of house under the Mission.</p> <p>The study has been conducted by the National Institute of Rural Development (NIRD), Hyderabad. The study report states that the impact of SGSY on the beneficiaries was not only visible in their living standard but also in other behavioral aspects like consumption pattern, saving behavior and increased accessibility to different amenities, like schooling, drinking water, sanitary latrine, electricity etc.</p> <p>It has been stated by the M/o Rural Development that most of the activities recommended in the study report are already being undertaken under revamped NRLM.</p>
16.	<p><u>Ministry of Women & Child Development</u></p> <p>Operationalisation of Anganwadi Centres under Integrated Child Development Service (ICDS)</p>	<p>Study Report submitted by the National Institute of Public Cooperation and Child Development (NIPCCD), has been examined by the M/o Women & Child Development. It has observed that the performance of the scheme has been satisfactory in achieving its objectives.</p>
17	<p><u>Ministry of Housing & Urban Poverty Alleviation</u></p> <p>Swarn Jayanti Sahari Rojgar Yojana (SJSRY) / Revamped as Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana- National Urban Livelihoods Mission (DAY-NULM).</p>	<p>The evaluation study of the SJSRY / NULM was entrusted to M/s Mott MacDonald. The study report has revealed that the said scheme has impacted the beneficiaries in terms of increase in income, upgrading of the social status etc. It has also helped in mobilisation of urban poor households to form their own institutions like micro-enterprises, Self Help Groups etc. The M/o HUPA has accepted the Report</p>

18	<p><u>Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship (erstwhile Ministry of Labour & Employment)</u></p> <p>Upgradation of ITIs into Centre of Excellence</p>	<p>The evaluation study has been got conducted by M/s Mott MacDonald. The study covered 30 ITIs, located in MCDs under VTIP. The report observes that overall the scheme has good impact as 91.2% of the pass outs from the ITIs covered by the study, are available in the job market; remaining 8.8% are either pursuing higher education or planning for the same. 60.4% of those available in the job market are wage employed or self-employed. 43.3% are regular employees, 40% are daily wage employed and 16.7% are contractual employees.</p>
19	<p><u>Department of Financial Services</u></p> <p>Priority Sector Lending</p>	<p>It has been informed that the Reserve Bank of India has conducted the evaluation study on "Credit Flow to Minority Communities for the year ending March, 2014" and the Study Report has also been furnished. DFS has informed that certain roadblocks in the credit flow to minorities have been identified in the Study Report. The D/o Financial Service has informed that in order to remove some of the bottlenecks, they have requested all Scheduled Commercial Banks to take necessary steps. Further, all Public Sector Banks have also been advised to take necessary action on the observations made in the study report.</p>

